



अ क्ष र वा इ म य

अंगाईगीते : भारतीय आणि जागतिक विशेषांक



Year : 14
Issues : 1 to 3
वर्ष : चौदावे
अंक : १ ते ३

Akshar Wangmay Special Issue
Lullabies : Indian & International

संपादक
डॉ. नानासाहेब सूर्यवंशी

July 2023 to
March 2024
जुलै २०२३ ते
मार्च २०२४



विश्वास व निरंतर सेवेची २५ वर्षाची परंपरा...



ओम गॅस एजन्सी, अहमदपूर



नविन कनेक्शन तात्काळ उपलब्ध

कागदपत्रे : फोटो -१, आधार कार्ड, बँक पासबुक



विनाशेगडी कनेक्शन उपलब्ध आहे.

पत्ता तळेगाव रोड, अहमदपूर
संपर्क ९९७५७४७७२ / ८६३८६७२८०

दुसरे सिलेंडर तात्काळ उपलब्ध

अत्यल्प दरात



- कागदपत्रे :-
- डा पेपर किंवा
 - उपभोक्ता कार्ड
 - आधार कार्ड

ऑफिस फो.नं.
०२३८९-२६३३८९
०२३८९-२६३३३३

५ इंस (अम्बड/उजव) (व्यवसायिक व घसगुती)

तात्काळ उपलब्ध



फक्त ओळखपत्र आणा
आणि लगेच
कनेक्शन घेवून जा..!

वेळ :
सकाळी ९.०० ते दु.१.००
दुपारी ३.०० ते साय.६.००



संचालक

श्री. महेंद्र खंडगाळे व
सौ. संगीता महेंद्र खंडगाळे,
अहमदपूर



आर. एन्. आय. फॉर इंडिया नवी दिल्ली
र. नं. - MAHMAR-36829-2010



ISSN – 2229-4929
UGC Approved and
Peer Reviewed Journal

अक्षर वाङ्मय

वर्ष : तेरावे अंक : एक-दोन-तीन

जुलै २०२३ ते मार्च २०२४

संपादक

डॉ. नानासाहेब सूर्यवंशी

कार्यकारी संपादक

डॉ. शिवाजीराव देशमुख

मार्गदर्शक

डॉ. अरुण प्रभुणे

संपादक मंडळ

डॉ. विजय वारकड

डॉ. रत्नाकर बेडगे

डॉ. दीपक चिद्दवार

डॉ. अंजली मस्करेन्हस

अमेरिकेतील समन्वयक

रमेश देशपांडे • सोनाली जांभेकर

प्रकाशक : सौ. रेखाताई नानासाहेब सूर्यवंशी, प्रतीक प्रकाशन,
'प्रणव', रुक्मे नगर, थोडगा रोड, अहमदपूर ४१३५१५.

मुद्रक : श्री. जे. प्रिंटर्स, प्रा.लि., १४१६, सदाशिव पेठ, पुणे-४११ ०३०

साहित्य व वर्गणी पाठविण्याचा पत्ता : डॉ. नानासाहेब सूर्यवंशी

'प्रणव', रुक्मे नगर, थोडगा रोड, अहमदपूर, ता. अहमदपूर

जि. लातूर ४१३५१५. भ्रमणध्वनी : ९४२३६५५८४१

E-mail : suryawanshinanasahaeb67@gmail.com.

<https://aksharwangmay.org>

अक्षरजुळणी: हेमा बेहेरे, पुणे, भ्रमणध्वनी- ९७६४२५९६८१

वार्षिक वर्गणी : रु. ५००/-

द्विवार्षिक वर्गणी : रु. ९००/-

पंचवार्षिक वर्गणी : रु. २०००/-

अंकाचे मूल्य : रु. ७००/-

- * महाराष्ट्र राज्य साहित्य आणि संस्कृती मंडळाने या नियतकालिकाच्या प्रकाशनार्थ अनुदान दिले असले तरी या नियतकालिकातील लेखकांच्या विचारांशी मंडळ व शासन सहमत असेलच असे नाही.
- * या अंकातील लेखांतून व्यक्त झालेल्या लेखकांच्या मतांशी संपादक, संपादक मंडळ, प्रकाशक व मुद्रक सहमत असतीलच असे नाही.

R. N. I. FOR INDIA New Delhi
R. No. – MAHMAR-36829-2010



ISSN – 2229-4929
UGC Approved and
Peer Reviewed Journal

AKSHAR WANGMAY

Year : 14 Volume 1-2-3

July 2023 to March 2024

April-May-June 2023

Editor-in-Chief

Dr. Nanasahab Suryawanshi

Executive Editor

Dr. Shivajirao Deshmukh

Advisor

Dr. Arun Prabhune

Editorial Board

Dr. Vijay Warkad
Dr. Ratnakar Bedge

Dr. Deepak Chiddarwar
Dr. Anjali Mascarenhas

U.S.A. Coordinator

Ramesh Deshpande ● Sonali Jambhekar

Publisher : Sou. Rekhtai Nanasahab Suryawanshi, Pratik Prakashan,
'Pranav', Rukme Nagar, Thodga Road, Ahmedpur 413515

Printer : Shri. J. Printers Pvt.Ltd. 1416, Sadashiv Peth, Pune 411 030

Address for sending articles and fees : Dr. Nanasahab Suryawanshi
'Pranav', Rukme Nagar, Thodga Road, Ahmedpur 413515. District : Latur

Mobile phone : 9423655841

E-mail : suryawanshinanasahab67@gmail.com

<https://aksharwangmay.org>

Typesetter : Hema Behere, Pune. Mobile : 9764259681

Subscription Rates Yearly : Rs. 500/-

Five Years : Rs. 2000/-

Two years : Rs. 900/-

Current Volume : Rs. 700/-

* Maharashtra State Literary and Cultural Board has granted funds for the Publication of this Journal. But Maharashtra State Literary and Cultural Board has not been responsible for writers opinion in this Journal.

* The content and opinions expressed in the articles are the views of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views and opinions of the periodical's Editorial Board, publisher or the advisor. The authors are solely responsible for the facts and accuracy of the content of the articles.

**अंगार्इगीते : भारतीय आणल जलगतक
अक्षर वलङ्मय अंगार्इगीत वलशेषलंक**

अतलथी संपलदक
डॉ. अरुण प्रभुणे

**Lullabies : Indian & International
Akshar Wangmay Lullaby Special Issue**

Guest Editor
Dr. Arun Prabhune

लागतो. तो गलबला आईला ऐकवत नाही. गलबला केल्याने बाळ जागा होईल असे वाटून ती म्हणते की 'करुं नका गलबला अगदीं । लागली झोंप मम बाळा !'.

'मृत तान्हुल्याच्या दुःखाने भ्रमित झालेल्या मातांनी तान्हुल्याला निद्रिस्त समजणे' या कल्पनाबंधाशी नाते असलेल्या मराठीतील या प्रसिद्ध कवितेचा संदर्भ म्हणूनच औचित्यपूर्ण ठरणारा आहे.

डॉ. नायजल नाटहाइम यांचा अंगाईगीताबाबतचा दृष्टिकोन जाणून घेण्यासाठी मुलाखत घेतली आहे. सर्व अनुवादांनंतर ती मुलाखत इथे समाविष्ट केली आहे.

Situated in the western region of Central Europe, Germany, officially known as the Federal Republic of Germany, is a country with Berlin as its capital and German as the official language.

Nestled in Central Europe, Austria lies to the south of Germany and is known for its stunning Alpine scenery and historic cities. Vienna, the capital, is celebrated for its imperial history, classical music heritage, and elegant architecture. The official language of Austria is German.

Japan, an island nation in East Asia, is often referred to as the Land of the Rising Sun because of its far-eastern position. Tokyo serves as the capital, and the official language is Japanese.

Contributor Yuta Chiba shared with us the Japanese version of Schubert's Lullaby and its English translation, explaining that although this is not originally a Japanese lullaby, it is often sung in Japan.

The original lyrics of the well-known Schubert's Lullaby are in German, and that version of the song was not penned by Schubert; moreover, who wrote the lyrics is unknown. It is said to have been written by the German poet Matthias Claudius (1740 – 1815), but it is not found in his collected writings.^{5, 6} Composed by the Austrian-born Schubert in November 1816, this lullaby gained immense fame and popularity, leading it to be commonly referred to as 'Schubert's Lullaby.'

Translation by two luminaries:

Numerous translations of the original German lullaby exist, and later in the text, we will introduce two English translations by distinguished figures: one by Henry G. Chapman and another by Nigel Nettheim. The English translation of the Japanese version featured in this article is not provided separately, as the translation received aligns with Chapman's rendition.

Henry Grafton Chapman was a versatile and gifted individual whose lifework centered on translating songs. Driven by a deep understanding of the

5. "Wiegenlied," International Music Score Library Project.

6. "Lullaby," The LiederNet Archive.

mood and spirit of each poem, Chapman transcended the typical constraints of translation. His work, characterized by excellence in poetic flow and fervor, elevated the art of song translation to a level of true artistry.

The rendition of the lullaby by Nigel Nettheim, Australia's distinguished senior researcher, musicologist, and former statistician, represents the second English translation featured in this article. An overview of his contributions and background will be presented in his biography at the conclusion of the article.

The singable translation made by Henry G. Chapman that was published in 1907 by G. Schirmer, a well-known music publisher in the United States,⁷ and the meaning-centered translation made by Nigel Nettheim, a senior scholar in musicology, that was included in his 'What is the real meaning of Schubert's famous Wiegenlied?' article published in 2019 in the journal *The Schubertian in the United Kingdom*⁸ are included for comparative thought. The span of 112 years between these two translations implies two key points. Firstly, it underscores the longstanding history of translating this lullaby. Secondly, it highlights the significance of Nettheim's decision to personally undertake a translation, driven by dissatisfaction with earlier renditions, in his quest to uncover the 'true meaning' of the lullaby. When juxtaposed, the two English translations reveal noticeable divergences in both wording and meaning. It becomes evident that varying interpretations of the lullaby stem from discrepancies in translation.

'Schubert's Lullaby' - meaning on two levels:

Across various countries, including Japan, this timeless lullaby continues to serenade infants to sleep. Renowned musicians and singers have been drawn to its charm, resulting in numerous arrangements and renditions. The song has been embraced and admired by both creators and the public alike. It gained immense popularity, a factor contributing to its enduring acclaim. This sustained popularity is evident even today. Despite the passage of more than 200 years since the composition of this lullaby, its charm continues to resonate in the hearts of discerning readers.

A finely crafted poem often escapes a definitive interpretation, and the same applies to Schubert's lullaby. In the context of this specific lullaby, the initial layer engages with its literal meaning, while the subsequent layer delves into its deeper significance.

7. Chapman (Schirmer).

8. Nettheim, "What is the real meaning of Schubert's famous Wiegenlied?"

Literal meaning:

On the level of literal meaning, this song's significance is as straightforward as any other lullaby. In this composition, the mother is expressing the lullaby much like any other mother would, gently swaying or cradling her baby, offering words of praise, and invoking prayers for the baby's well-being, happiness, and contentment. The German title 'Wiegenlied' combines two words: 'wiegen' (to rock or cradle) and 'lied' (song), and is sometimes translated as 'Cradlesong,' explained Nettheim. The societal consciousness likely experienced a delightful interpretation of 'Schubert's Lullaby.' Hearing the song's recording, one could have been captivated by the singers' melodious voices and the enchanting audible music. Nevertheless, the thoughtful phrasing in certain parts of the poem by the anonymous poet begins to evoke varied meanings in a critical and analytical mind.

Implied meaning:

Even without listening to a recording or rendition of this lullaby, merely examining its literary form enables us to perceive its implied meaning.

* In this context, let's initially observe the phrasing in the second verse of the English translations:

As the mother tenderly cradles the baby to sleep - the line "Slumber, slumber, all so sweetly buried" appears in Henry G. Chapman's translation, while Nigel Nettheim translates it as "Sleep in your welcoming grave," followed by the assurance "your mother's arms will still protect you."

The terms 'buried' or 'grave,' as well as 'still protect,' employed in the lullaby, elevate its meaning to a realm of implied significance.

* The word arrangement in the final verse of the lullaby holds significance in this context as well:

"Sleep in the velvet fold, the pure sound of love will still be heard around you; a lily and rose will be your reward once you are asleep" - The phrasing in Nettheim's translation imparts a feeling of continuity within the implied meaning.

The implied meaning within the lullaby draws it nearer to a sorrowful song. Is the affectionate mother tenderly lulling the baby to sleep, or is she conveying her sorrow by singing a lullaby to a baby who has closed their eyes forever? The wording of the lullaby, crafted in this manner, perpetuates the internal undercurrent of sorrow. Upon reading the lullaby, what resonates with a discerning reader is the depiction of a mother's unsettled and poignant heart, her boundless love for the baby, and the profound anguish felt by the mother due to the baby's departure. Thus, at this level, the emotional tone resembles that of an elegy.

The motif of envisioning a baby peacefully asleep, closing their eyes, and singing a lullaby to usher them into slumber is present in lullabies across various cultures (as seen in the Ecuadorian Lullaby: ‘The last lullaby’ featured in this special issue). Consequently, such lullabies carry a layer of poignant significance, bordering on mournful songs at times. At one level, they are dirges.

Lullabies stemming from such themes are absent in Marathi. Nevertheless, a renowned Marathi poem inspired by this motif comes to mind.

Marathi poet Govindagraj’s poem ‘My Swan Has Slept!’ :

Renowned Marathi author Ram Ganesh Gadkari (1885 - 1919), who wrote under the pen name Govindagraj, composed numerous poems. His anthology 'Vagvairjayanti' (वागवैजयंती) includes the extended poem 'My Swan Has Slept!' (राजहंस माझा निजला!), which is centered around the aforementioned motif.

In introducing this poem, the poet Govindagraj contemplates (translated below from Marathi):

“Could there not be such an illusion for a grieving mother who, within a brief span after the passing of her husband, faces the heartbreaking event of her only child's death?”

As the poet articulates the theme with clarity, the poem unfolds on the level of literal meaning. ‘Culmination of grief, fixated delusion in her mind,’ (‘होउनी कळस शोकाचा । भ्रम तिच्या मानसी बसला ।’) - the mother, then, starts to perceive her beautiful and adorable baby not as lifeless but as graceful and charming as a swan. Unable to accept the reality of her child's demise, she begins to believe, 'My swan has slept!' Some lines carrying significance within the context of the aforementioned motif are:

Say, who proclaimed this?

My swan has slept!

At the summit of sorrow, a newly widowed grieving mother!

That's a mother's heart, I'm not saying so without reason.

.....

Child's demise on her lap, jolted her heart.

Culmination of grief, fixated delusion in her mind.

.....

A small group gathered near, intent on retrieving the lifeless infant.

.....

She cried to all, ‘my swan has slept!’

No commotion at all, my infant is sleeping!

.....

The grieving widow cradles her deceased infant on her lap, lost in sorrow and gripped by the delusion that her baby is peacefully asleep. Despite the

gathering of family, friends, and neighbours adhering to local customs for the funeral, the mother vehemently insists that her child is not dead but merely in a deep slumber. As they implore her to allow them to carry the baby to the cremation grounds, she becomes distraught, convinced that their pleas and discussions will awaken the sleeping child. In the face of persistent requests, the noise escalates into an overwhelming commotion for her, and unable to bear it, she desperately asserts, 'No commotion at all, my infant is sleeping!'

The mention of this famous Marathi poem here, connected to the motif of 'mothers, deluded by the grief of a deceased infant, perceive the baby as asleep,' is thus fitting.

After the various translations of Schubert's Lullaby, an interview with Nigel Nettheim follows, where he delves into his unique perspectives on the lullaby, helping us gain a deeper understanding of its rich nuances.

Schubert's Lullaby - शूबर्टचे अंगाईगीत

Japanese Lullaby Contributor :
Yuta Chiba

Marathi Translation :
Dr. Arun Prabhune

जपानी अंगाईगीत उपलब्धकर्ता : युटा चिबा

मराठी अनुवाद : डॉ. अरुण प्रभुणे

| Original German | Japanese Translation |
|--|--|
| Schlafe, schlafe, holder, süßer Knabe, leise wiegt dich deiner Mutter Hand; sanfte Ruhe, milde Labe bringt dir schwebend dieses Wiegenband. | ねむれねむれ 母の胸(むね)に ねむれねむれ 母の手に こころよき 歌声に むすばずや 楽しゆめ |
| Schlafe, schlafe in dem süßen Grabe, noch beschützt dich deiner Mutter Arm; alle Wünsche, alle Habe faßt sie liebend, alle liebewarm. | ねむれねむれ 母の胸に ねむれねむれ 母の手に あたたかき その袖(そで)に つつまれてねむれよや |
| Schlafe, schlafe in der Flaumen Schoße, noch umtönt dich lauter Liebeston; eine Lilie, eine Rose, nach dem Schlafe werd' sie dir zum Lohn. | ねむれねむれ かわいわく子(ご) 一夜(ひとよ)寝(い)ねてさめてみよ くれないのばらの花 開くぞやまくらべに |
| | ねむれねむれ 母の胸に 一夜寝ねて 起きてみよ かおりよき ゆきの花 におうぞや ゆりかごに |

| Chapman's English Translation (singable) of Original German | Marathi Translation of Chapman's English Translation | Nettheim's English Translation (meaning-centered) of Original German | Marathi Translation of Nettheim's Marathi Translation |
|--|--|--|--|
| <p>Slumber, slumber, O my darling baby,</p> <p>Gently rocked by Mother's gentle hand;</p> <p>Softly rest and safely slumber, While she swings thee by this cradle- band.</p> <p>Slumber, slumber, all so sweetly buried, Guarded by thy mother's loving arm;</p> <p>All her wishes, all possessions, And her love, shall shelter thee from harm.</p> | <p>मम लाडुल्या सोनुल्या तान्हुल्या करी निनी निनी, करी निनी निनी, झुलवी तुजलागी माय मायाळू हाती</p> <p>नको भिऊ पहुड आरामी करी निनी जव ओढीत पाळणादोरी झुलवी माय तुजलागी</p> <p>करी निनी निनी, करी निनी निनी, अति सुखे 'गाडलेल्या' असशी सुरक्षित मातेच्या मायाळू बाहुत असशी</p> <p>कामना तमाम मम, सर्वस्व सारे मम अन् प्रेम सारे मम असे राखण्या तव आसरा तिज</p> | <p>Sleep, fair sweet boy,</p> <p>your mother's hand is gently rocking you; this cradling waistband is bringing you tender peace and sympathetic comfort, with its swaying</p> <p>Sleep in your welcoming grave, your mother's arms will still protect you;</p> <p>she will lovingly take care of everything you had wished for and all your belongings, all of them with the warmth of love.</p> | <p>करी निनी गोड गोमट्या मुला झुलविती तुज अलगद तव मातेचे हात; झुलविता तुज झुले कमरबंद, देईल झुलता आराम सुखदायी तुज अन् शांती नीरव</p> <p>करी निनी स्वागत करत्या थडगी बाहू तुज तरीही तव मातेचे रक्षितील</p> <p>होते जे सारे इच्छिले तू न् असती ज्या सकल चीजवस्तू तुज जवळी, करील माय प्रेमभरे जपणूक तयांची देऊनी ऊब तयांना मायेची</p> |

9. "sweetly buried" - lovely warm down bedding (Guy Lafaille's beautiful French translation of the text has the boy snuggling into a 'duvet')
Malcolm Wren, "Wiegenlied (Schlafe, Schlafe, Holder, Süßer Knabe), D 498: Lullaby,"
Schubert Song Texts, accessed November 23, 2023,

<https://www.schubertsong.uk/text/wiegenlied-schlafe-schlafe-holder-susser-knabe>.

| Chapman's English Translation (singable) of Original German | Marathi Translation of Chapman's English Translation | Nettheim's English Translation (meaning-centered) of Original German | Marathi Translation of Nettheim's Marathi Translation |
|---|--|---|--|
| Slumber, slumber, warm thy nest and downy, Many a loving song for thee she'll sing; Then a rosebud and a lily, When thou wakest, she to thee will bring. | करी निनी निनी, करी निनी निनी, भरले असे तव घाटे ऊबदार न मृदु पिसांनी गाईन तुज बहु वात्सल्यगीते, जागता तू आणीन कलिका गुलाब न सुमन लिली तुजलागी | Sleep in the velvet fold, the pure sound of love will still be heard around you; a lily and a rose will be your reward once you are asleep. | करी निनी लपेटल्या मखमली गुंडाळीत विमल वात्सल्यध्वनी गुंजतील तव भवती लिली न गुलाब होता निद्रिस्त लाभतील तुज हे पुरस्कार. |

An Interview with Nigel Nettheim

Dr. Arun Prabhune : How would you characterize the significance of Franz Peter Schubert's contributions to the world of classical music and broader musical landscapes?

Dr. Nigel Nettheim : Schubert (1797-1828) was one of the “great” composers. By that I mean, firstly, that he had something to say (that is, a view of the world) that was and still is of interest to many people and, secondly, that he had the ability to put that view into musical terms (rather than into verbal terms as a great poet would do, or as other artists would do in their medium). Schubert composed a vast number of works in almost all the genres of classical music in his short life. His works have occasionally been adapted for popularization, as for instance in the operetta Blossom Time, also known as Lilac Time, as well as in a Japanese version of the present work *Wiegenlied*.

Arun : What will the reader need to know in advance, so as to be ready to follow the present interview?

Nigel : The gist of it is that I believe I found the real meaning of this lullaby, which unfortunately had been seriously misunderstood by everyone or almost everyone, including myself! My first publication on this topic was an article “What is the real meaning of Schubert’s famous *Wiegenlied*?” in The

Schubertian.¹⁰ My second was a video “Schubert’s Lullaby in the presence of Death” for The International Musicological Society,¹¹ placed also on YouTube.¹² Please listen to the lullaby sung by Janet Baker on YouTube; copyright prevents me from including that recorded performance here.¹³

Arun : From a musicological perspective, what are your thoughts regarding what made Schubert's Wiegenlied D498 lullaby so appealing that it has been translated into other languages and is favored in other countries (e.g. a contributor from Japan mentions: This is not really a Japanese lullaby, but it is often sung in Japan.)

Nigel : It is natural to wonder just what made this song, and some others, so appealing, but I don’t think anyone can know. Even Schubert would not have been able to answer this question. Within a few teenage years he had become perhaps the greatest song-writer of all time, from which we can see how natural song-writing was for him. Some impression of his personality can be gained from his surviving letters, which might help us to understand his character and view of life, but would not assist us directly with the analysis of his compositions, about which I think he never spoke. I suspect, but cannot prove, that his vocal melodies constitute a musical rendition of the local Viennese manner of speaking at that time, with its specially attractive lilt, so that he only had to imagine what was spoken to ‘translate’ it into music. On that view, Schubert knew two languages fluently: German poetry, and music; and he could translate immediately from the former to the latter, with an Austrian ‘accent’.

10. Nettheim, “What is the real meaning of Schubert’s famous Wiegenlied?”.

11. Nora Beck et al., “Music in a Time of COVID-19,” *Musicological Brainfood (International Musicological Society)* 4, no. 1 (April 21, 2020), accessed December 5, 2023,

<https://brainfood.musicology.org/vol-4-no-1-2020/music-in-a-time-of-covid-19/>.

12. “Schubert’s Wiegenlied D498 -- Its Real Meaning,” Nigel Nettheim Musicology, presented May 3, 2020, uploaded September 8, 2020, YouTube video, 14:50,

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wqF8pg-bpGk>.

13. “Wiegenlied, Op. 98 No. 2, d. 498,” Janet Baker - Topic (Warner Classics), March 13, 2017, YouTube video, 2:59,

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7aSdcht0vFA>.

As another example, I can no more say what gives ‘Abide with Me’ its universal appeal. It is a hymn rather than a lullaby, but it is of course associated with death, and has a consoling quality; it was Gandhi’s favorite hymn. Apparently, the poem was first written in 1820, about four years after Schubert composed the present lullaby. The two appealing melodies have some features in common, a topic which however I will not pursue here.

Arun : What prompted you to seek the real meaning in Schubert's lullaby?

Nigel : I was preparing an introductory talk about musicology for 10 March 2019 at my local University department to a general academic audience, mostly not musicians. I thought a discussion of that song could be made approachable to the audience. When studying the song for the purpose of the talk, the real meaning occurred to me, as I will now explain. Thus I was not in fact seeking the real meaning, but it became clear to me, or ‘jumped out’.

I began by reading the poem and some of its customary translations. Then I studied the composition in relation to the poem, based on what I knew at that stage. The singing portion seemed to be set in a straightforward way. But I then looked at the postlude for the piano alone (the last two measures.); it too was set straightforwardly, except that it was not clear why those pairs of high and low notes (technically 12ths, referring to the number of scale steps between them) had been included, because the music was already fully satisfactory without that top note. When puzzling over the question why those 12ths had been added, I recalled the song “Das Züenglöcklein” (“The Passing Bell”) D871. (Please listen to it on YouTube sung by Christian Gerhaher; copyright prevents me from including that recorded performance here.¹⁴) The term ‘passing bell’ refers to the bell that was conventionally rung when a local person was dying, thus ‘passing away’, in order to inform the community, so it is not the same as a ‘funeral bell’. That recollection was the key to solving the mystery. In that song, D871, the 12ths obviously represent the passing bell, for that is the very title of the song; that told me that it might well represent a passing bell here in D498 too, and re-reading the poem with that indication provided by Schubert caused it all to unravel. A moral is that musicologists need to know a lot of music and to have it at their fingertips. One seems to scan through the previous input subconsciously to compare it with the present input. It is hard to think that the question posed could have been answered by any computerized or AI means, and I am always glad to find cases where human mental work is still needed!

14. “Das Züenglöcklein, D 871,” Christian Gerhaher - Topic, September 23, 2014, YouTube video, 4:43,

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SXbGpHfrLg4>.

Arun: How do you believe your lullaby translation is different and conveys meaning (compared to the other translations commonly available/used)?

Nigel : Once I had found the first clue in the song's postlude, it became clear that previous translators had (with just a few occasional partial exceptions) assumed the conventional lullaby concept. By working backwards from the endpoint, the passing bell, I could then unravel the poem's meaning. Examples of some of the details are seen in my publications on this song, cited earlier.

Arun : Could you explain why people have commonly understood 'grave' "as a metaphor for the child's bed"?

Nigel : People had assumed the conventional lullaby significance, because of the generic title of the song and because the real meaning is not revealed at all in the first verse. When those people came to the other verses, they therefore had to try to rationalize their translation of the whole poem. This is an everyday occurrence: if an inconvenient feature doesn't fit one's preconception, one's first reaction might be to modify or twist that feature a little to make it fit in. One assumes that the feature is somehow wrong or incongruous, rather than that one's preconception was wrong. Examples involving many such features are sometimes found.¹⁵ I am not being critical here, for we cannot be expected to constantly challenge all our preconceptions! Indeed, I too had been uncertain about the same matter for many years.

To look further into this question, we can note that Schubert's musical setting of this poem is 'strophic': that is, each verse or strophe is set to the same music. Other songs are instead 'through-composed': that is, the composer varies the music appropriately for the poetry of each individual verse. The first verse of this poem required only a nice and comfortable setting for, so far, the poem represents no more than a conventional lullaby. Schubert used the same music for the following two verses, thus not reflecting their different poetic implications in his music. As I have shown, the representation of the passing bell in this music reflects the meaning of the 2nd and 3rd verses, so Schubert was well aware of that meaning; but he did not reflect that meaning in the melodies for those other verses. He evidently thought the sound of the passing bell rendered by the piano (not by the mother – here we see the value of his instrumental commentary) was all that was required. After all, the mother would not want to upset the dying child by singing a lamentation, for she wants to make sure his death is peaceful. So she continues to sing a conventional lullaby to him; but that fact – resulting in the poem being set as a strophic song, repeating the music of the first verse – no doubt explains why the piece as a whole has been received as 'just' a conventional lullaby. Listeners had

15. Wren, "Wiegenlied."

missed the passing bell in the piano postlude of each verse, perhaps partly because that bell was an old custom that is, as far as my inquiries have indicated, no longer observed. The listeners had paid attention to the singing, but not sufficiently to the postlude played by the piano. In sum, the mother's manner of singing according to Schubert's song hid the truth (fortunately) from her child and thus also (unfortunately) from the listener-translator.

Arun : Could you explain the nuanced/real meaning of Schubert's lullaby?

Nigel : The real meaning of the song is the same as the real meaning of the poem. It gives the thoughts of a mother whose child is about to die. The death of a child was a common occurrence at the time, and such a portrait was a common kind of purpose of a poet's endeavors.

Arun : What do you believe may have inspired the unknown author or perhaps Matthias Claudius to introduce "grave" and to mention "a lily and a rose will be your reward once you are asleep," especially in a lullaby (high infant mortality at the time, assuming Claudius to be the author - something personal he may have experienced, written for a particular friend facing loss of a child etc.)?

Nigel : The "grave" drew attention to the child's approaching death; "a lily and a rose" were customarily placed on the coffin, the lily representing purity of soul and the rose representing love. Such a poem was most likely intended simply to capture an imagined mood. It's true that poems are occasionally written in association with a particular event, but I don't think that's likely in this case, although of course I cannot be sure. It might be helpful if we knew who the poet was and could compare this with his other poems, but unfortunately we don't know that.

Arun : What do you believe may have inspired Schubert to introduce "funeral bells" in a lullaby - was he trying to be faithful to the meaning he found in the lullaby and/or an influence of other conditions (high infant mortality at the time, something personal he may have experienced, for a particular friend facing loss of a child etc.)?

Nigel : First, a small correction: in my video I should have said "a passing bell", which is rung at the time when death is imminent, rather than "funeral bells", which are rung at the subsequent funeral. Schubert introduced the passing bell into his postlude to the song because that provided an appropriate musical commentary on the poem as he understood it (he was extremely sensitive to poetry) and on the song itself – something he did on innumerable occasions in other works, especially songs. I don't know of any evidence that Schubert chose that poem in connection with a particular event – he chose any and every poem that appealed to him for any reason, and very rapidly set

them to music – to a total of over 600 songs in a very short life, as well as a large amount of other vocal music including operas and Masses; his instrumental music is a separate story again.

Arun : As you mention, "sleep" in this lullaby is, in your view, intended to be an "euphemism or metaphor for dying." Do you believe Schubert meant this lullaby to be played/sung casually or especially during difficult times, such as (as you mention) when a rose and a lily will be thrown on the child's coffin?

Nigel : Usually, after Schubert finished composing one song, he immediately went on to compose another one, thinking little or nothing more about the one just finished (occasionally not even recognizing his own songs – when hearing one of them later, he might ask who wrote it!). On one amazing day (15 October 1815) he set eight songs! I don't think he had any thoughts as to when the present one might be sung, other than just whenever someone felt inclined to savor and appreciate that poem and its musical rendition.

Arun : Are there any other nuances regarding this lullaby you would like to share that would help readers appreciate this song even more?

Nigel : I could mention the accent marks at the start of each of the last two measures, but nowhere else in this music, for they can surely be taken to indicate an emphasis on the 'down' phase of the bell-ringing. The word 'süß' (sweet) is set with a turn around its main note, somewhat as it would be spoken when giving full meaning to the word – that can not be an accident, and similar 'word-painting' occurs throughout his compositions. The pair of grace notes on the word 'milde' (gentle etc.) at the highest point of the melody is a simple resource but very effective – imagine those notes being removed!

Arun : Are there any versions/translations of this lullaby that you believe are interesting/noteworthy in some respect?

Nigel : Of the many versions of the Schubert song translations, I usually look at those of Wigmore (1992) and Reed (1985). The line "Alle Wünsche, alle Habe" posed a problem for me because it does not indicate whether all the 'wishes' and 'possessions' are those of the mother or of the son – I assumed the latter because the mother is speaking to the son about himself, but others, including Wigmore and Reed, assumed the former; for the present purpose that choice is not important. Also, Reed (page 438) commented "The shadow of the grave ... finds no place in Schubert's music", a comment which we now know to be false.

Arun : Do you have any thoughts on the typical structure of a lullaby from a musicological perspective, and could you share any lullaby example(s) that are interesting and may not follow the expectation (soothing or other interesting aspect)?

Nigel : The Chopin *Berceuse* (the French word for Lullaby or Cradlesong) has a considerably different character in its central portion – I am presently completing an article discussing that piece, but I’ll have to allow that article to take its course without preempting it. The lullaby wrongly attributed to Mozart is a typical and very nice one. The Brahms Lullaby is very popular too – I have today (3 December 2023) made available a little-known unaccompanied open-air rendition by Lotte Lehmann singing that lullaby charmingly to a koala bear, as a small offering from Australia to the readers of this journal.¹⁶ There is another equally charming rendition by the same singer to a human baby as part of the 1948 film “Big City”.¹⁷

Arun : If and how do you believe (intentionally or perhaps subconsciously) your extensive background/approach in the study of mathematics may have influenced your study and research in musicology (especially in this lullaby or elsewhere)?

Nigel : I try not to take anything for granted – until something is proven to one’s satisfaction, it should be considered not yet known! That applies in all fields but perhaps most ruthlessly in mathematics. If one had studied only musicology or other subjects one might (though one would not necessarily) lack that point of view. Even the pursuit of truth is sometimes called into question today, but without it one wouldn’t get far in mathematics, so perhaps mathematical training helps us to recognize the foremost place of truth in all spheres. I have also been closely associated with the game of chess and chess problems, which I could recommend in this connection.

Arun : Have you noticed any changes in the nature/style of lullabies over the last several decades of your study (in case you have come across any new lullabies compared to the traditional ones)?

Nigel : I haven’t come across any, but of course there might well be some.

Arun : What do you think is the significance of your findings about this Lullaby?

Nigel : Considering the many serious problems the world is facing, the significance must be regarded as modest. But within the field of musicology

16. “Lotte Lehmann Sings the Brahms Lullaby to a Koala Bear,” Nigel Nettheim Musicology, December 2, 2023, YouTube video, 1:29,

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-mb3ikZZQ5M>.

17. “Lotte Lehmann - Various,” Roger York, August 25, 2007, YouTube video, 4:55,

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OWXejgfzUD8>.

it is notable that this famous song had been misunderstood for the 200 years since its composition, which gives some significance to the findings. Further, when one is absorbed in purely artistic questions, the problems of the outside world usually recede, which can lead to some exaggeration – on a broader view – of the significance of one’s work.

Arun : Is there anything else that you would like to share?

Nigel : I am tempted to mention a most unusual approach to putting a child to sleep with music. This is, on the academic side, the work of Jean Gabbert Harrell; two books of hers are: *Profundity*. Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1992, and *Soundtracks : A Study of Auditory Perception, Memory, and Valuation*. Buffalo: Prometheus Books, 1986 (see especially page 25).

The idea is that a fetus hears, quite loudly and 24 hours a day, the various sounds that reach the mother’s womb. The hearing of the fetus is sufficiently developed by the 5th or 6th month of gestation. After birth, the idea of a return to the environment of the womb is attractive and comforting to the baby, and promotes sleep (withdrawal from the outside world). It is ethically impossible to record those sounds (one attempt seems to have involved recording from the womb of a sheep or pig, and another may have been obtained accidentally during surgery on a human mother). But to the extent that such a recording exists, it can be played back, promoting sleep. That has been found to happen very reliably by the Prince Lionheart company,¹⁸ with commercial success. Music that shares the rhythmic and other features of the womb sounds might, therefore, be expected also to be capable of functioning as a lullaby. Suitable musical excerpts were suggested by Harrell. I do not wish to take sides in the debate about this rather speculative matter, but mention it in case it has any theoretical or practical interest for the reader. Further questions might arise. To what age beyond infancy does the effect endure? (conceivably in an attenuated way throughout the rest of life). Could it apply to all womb-born entities throughout history? Might it have a bearing on comfortable tempos and rhythms for music in general?

Arun : What is your last word?

Nigel : Finally, I would like to thank Arun Prabhune for attributing significance to my work, and for encouraging me to answer his excellent questions.

18. “Original Slumber Bear®,” Prince Lionheart, accessed December 5, 2023,

<https://princelionheart.com/products/original-slumberbear>.

About Dr. Nigel Nettheim



Nigel Nettheim's early work was in mathematical statistics, with a PhD from Stanford University in 1966. He changed careers by studying music full-time at the Royal Conservatory of Music, Toronto, Canada for the whole of the 1970s. He then joined the Music Research Centre at the Sydney Conservatorium of Music, 1980 to 1986. Further studies in musicology resulted in a PhD from the University of New South Wales in 2001. He then took a position as adjunct research fellow at the MARCS Institute, Western Sydney University, which he still holds today. He has published widely in musicology, mostly with an analytical leaning and including an annotated translation of a book by the early musicologist Gustav Becking.

-
- * We express our gratitude to Mr. Yuta Chiba from Tokyo, Japan for providing the Japanese version of Schubert's Lullaby.
 - * We extend our sincere gratitude to Dr. Nigel Nettheim for generously sharing his insightful analysis, enabling readers to unlock the real meaning of Schubert's lullaby and deepen their appreciation for its subtle nuances.
 - * German map (orthographic projection) attribution :
Rob984, CC BY-SA 4.0

<<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>>, via Wikimedia Commons.

- * Japan map (orthographic projection) attribution :
Connormah, CC BY-SA 3.0

<<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0/>>, via Wikimedia Commons.

